Pastorals-related presentations at SBL 2021
(https://www.sbl-site.org/meetings/Congresses_ProgramBook.aspx?MeetingId=39)

Carson Bay, University of Bern
"To Instruct, to Rebuke, to Correct": 2 Timothy 3:16, Josephus *Against Apion* 1.3, and Hellenistic Apologetic between Christian Epistolography and Jewish Historiography

2 Timothy 3:16 contains three Greek nouns that correspond to three verbs in Flavius Josephus' *Contra Apionem* 1.3. The author of 2 Timothy states that "all scripture" is good "for teaching (πρὸς διδασκαλίαν), for rebuking (πρὸς ἐλεγμόν), for correcting (πρὸς ἐπανόρθωσιν), and for training (πρὸς παιδείαν) in righteousness" (3:16). The first three of these prepositioned nouns correspond to three verbs Josephus uses in explaining the impetus for his penning his most overtly apologetic work, the *Contra Apionem*: "I thought it necessary to write briefly on all these matters, to rebuke (ἐλέγξαι) those who insult us as guilty of malice and deliberate falsehood, to correct (ἐπανορθώσασθαι) the ignorance of others, and to instruct (διδάξαι) all who wish to know the truth on the subject of our antiquity. At first glance, the overlap seems incidental: a didactic letter to a young convert and a sprawling multicultural apologetic aimed at widespread anti-Jewish polemic are not the same kind of literature on the face of it. But I suggest that they are. In this paper I show how, when situated in their respective literary and cultural locations, the author of 2 Timothy and Josephus are doing fundamentally the same rhetorical thing in these passages: justifying their own scribal enterprises in an attempt to restructure, codify, and perpetuate their own inherited traditions.

Greg Beale, Reformed Theological Seminary
"Fight the Good Fight" in 1 Tim. 1:18

The combined wording in 1 Tim. 1:18 of στρατεύω + στρατεία (a cognate accusative) can be rendered "fight the fight," "battle the battle," or more generally "perform military service" or "serve in a military campaign." Apparently, no one has surveyed this combination in extra-biblical literature. The combination occurs often throughout Greco-Roman literature to express a patriotic idiom for someone whose good character and reputation is demonstrated by faithfully persevering in some kind of extended battle campaign. This is applied to Timothy to demonstrate his good Christian character and reputation over against the false teachers' bad character. The idiom also occurs often in a legal context to affirm the character and good reputation qualifying a person to be an officer of the court or endorsing a person's character before the court in a legal dispute, showing him to be worthy to be considered of an innocent verdict. This occurs often in a context where the accusations are not true. Eight of the seventeen legal uses actually have reference to "witnesses" in the context (either μάρτυς or the verb form or other cognate forms). In 1 Timothy this idiom is used in a legal context (where also the μάρτυς word group is repeatedly used), which is to demonstrate and acquit Timothy's character and reputation over and against that of the false teachers. The redundant word combination of ἀγωνίζομαι + ἀγών ("struggle the struggle") in 1 Tim. 6:12 and 2 Tim. 4:7 is recognized by commentators as a development of the phrase in 1 Tim. 1:18. This combination also has not been studied in the Greek world, where it is also a well-worn idiom used in the same way as the στρατεύω + στρατεία expression probably to highlight the difficulty of the fight. This is why the expression ἀγωνίζομαι + ἀγών is used synonymously, even together with the adjective "good," with that in 1 Tim. 1:18. Some translations even translate the redundant expressions in 1 Tim. 1:18, 1 Tim. 6:12, and 2 Tim. 4:7 as "fight the good fight," clearly seeing them as synonymous. The above Greco-Roman study of usage endorses such a synonymous understanding.

Brad Bitner, Westminster Seminary California
1 Timothy and the Confession Inscriptions of Asia Minor

The so-called confession inscriptions (*Beichtinschriften*) from Asia Minor offer an illuminating differential context for certain lexical, rhetorical and theological features of 1 Timothy. Recent work on the performative aspects of these texts from the regions around Ephesus should inform our interpretation of, *inter alia*, 1 Tim 2:5-6; 3:14-16. By comparison and contrast, these inscriptions highlight overlooked elements of the ways in which acclamation, confession, theology and Christology interact with and support the paraenesis of 1 Timothy.

David R. Edwards, Florida State University
"Taken Up in Glory": Early Christian Traditions of the Ascension of Jesus in Light of 1 Tim. 3:16

The hymn of 1 Tim. 3:16 initially appears to follow a chronological sequence which moves from incarnation ("revealed in flesh"), resurrection ("vindicated in spirit"), and exaltation of Jesus ("seen by angels") to the expansion of the early Christian movement into the non-Jewish Mediterranean world through kerygmatic proclamation ("proclaimed among Gentiles, believed in throughout the world"). However, the interpretation of the hymn as a simple chronological sequence has been frustrated by the last line ("taken up in glory"), which appears to refer unambiguously to the ascension of Jesus, thus placing it chronologically after the gospel preaching and early missionary activity. A chronological reading has, therefore, widely been regarded as impossible. However, this judgement appears to be founded upon the presumption of the normativity of the narrative sequence presented in Luke-Acts, in which the ascension takes place either immediately following the resurrection (Lk. 24) or forty days afterwards (Acts 1), but in any case well before the movement's missionary activities and expansion. This study will reconsider a chronological reading of the hymn in 1 Tim. 3:16 and argue that it is evidence for early Christian traditions which understood the ascension of Jesus to have taken place after the earliest missionary activities and expansion among non-Jewish peoples beyond the confines of Judea. I will survey the evidence of the creed in 1 Cor. 15 and the narrative of Luke-Acts in order to ascertain the sequence of events which a later reader might infer on their basis. 1 Cor. 15 is chronologically ambiguous in that, although it refers to multiple appearances of the resurrected Jesus over a long period of time, and places Paul last in that sequence of appearances, it does not explicitly refer to an/the ascension, and says nothing of the timing of the sequence of events in relation to early missionary activities. Taken on its own, therefore, it is insufficient to produce the sequence in 1 Tim. 3:16. While the narrative of Luke-Acts is generally read as restricting the ascension to the period immediately after or forty days subsequent to the resurrection, I will argue that the two ascensions of Lk. 24 and Acts 1 could have been approached by a later reader as narrating multiple resurrection appearances and multiple ascensions during an ongoing period of time—just as in 1 Cor. 15. I conclude, therefore, that 1 Tim. 3:16 reflects an attempt by early Christians to harmonize and piece together the creed of 1 Cor. 15 and the narrative of Luke-Acts. The former makes clear that there were many ongoing post-resurrection appearances by Jesus, with Paul being the very last and quite late, though otherwise of unspecified timing; Luke-Acts narrates two distinct appearances and ascensions, and additionally clarifies that Paul's post-resurrection appearance (Acts 9) occurred subsequent to the initial missionary proclamation and expansion among non-Jews (Acts 8). A harmonized reading of two early Christian texts explains the chronological sequence of events in the hymn of 1 Tim. 3:16, wherein ascension is placed subsequent to kerygmatic proclamation and missionary activity.

Paul Robertson, University of New Hampshire
Cluster Mapping Paul's Letters: Grouping and Identifying the Location of Stylistic Similarities

Written with the assistance of Ashley Roy, Department of Computer Science, University of New Hampshire. This paper explores the similarity of Paul's seven undisputed letters through cluster mapping. Clustering occurs based upon the location of twenty stylistic features of Paul's letters identified in a previous monograph ([*Paul's Letters and Contemporary Greco-Roman Literature: Theorizing a New Taxonomy*,] Brill, NovTSup, 2016). These clusters assist in identifying which of the letters are closer in form and in style, and based on which stylistic criteria, in a contribution to the field's exploration of similarity between the letters. The question of similarity is ongoing in Pauline Studies, due to the varying lengths and complexities of the letters as well as the application of new tools for comparison. A visualization tool such as cluster mapping allows for quick identification of similarities or dissimilarities by the non-specialist. For instance, with cluster analysis it is easy to see that Romans and 1 Corinthians overlap on many criteria and locations. However, identifying unusual clusters (such as 1 Thessalonians and 1 Corinthians) is a central goal of this study, to support or dispute certain predictions made about the similarities of the letters in qualitative studies and commentaries. Certain letters generally thought to be different, for example Romans and Philippians, may prove to have certain similarities in particular areas. Meanwhile, other letter pairs generally thought to be similar, for example Romans and 1 Corinthians, may also contain areas of particular difference. Cluster mapping is a visualization technique that shows specifically where documents cluster based on selected measures or characteristics. Cluster mapping is particularly useful for identifying patterns within textual data because it allows for multiple data sets to be seen on the same plot, which in turn creates a space to easily identify commonalities. In our case, the data patterns are based on the location of twenty frequently used stylistic devices by Paul within each letter (e.g., religious claims, use of metaphor, questions). Due to the varying lengths of the letters, we normalize each letter's data to allow for comparison with another on the same graph. We chose to

normalize each letter into dectiles, allowing for the data from each letter to overlap and cluster on a comparatively consistent basis, imparting a ten-part "shape" to each letter's clustering according to our chosen stylistic criteria. The presentation will include a simple explanation of cluster mapping, a description about how and why the letter lengths were normalized, an illustration and discussion of key findings from cluster mapping Paul's letters, and a conclusion that places our findings in conversation with qualitative studies and commentaries in the field.

Jonathan Sanchez, University of Notre Dame
Making an Example: The Rhetorical Usefulness of Timothy in 1 Timothy

One of the fruits of scholarly investigation into ancient pseudepigraphy is an appreciation of its implications for interpreting pseudepigraphal texts. For example, David Lincicum notes that, in a pseudepigraphal letter, "[t]he communicative triad of author, addressee, and situation becomes opaque," and analyzes the rhetorically constructed situation in Colossians (2018). Indebted to his articulation of this triad, this presentation focuses on the second member of the triad in 1 Timothy, arguing that the Pastor's selection of Timothy as the addressee is useful for the Pastor in articulating various aspects of his message. Timothy's exemplarity is particularly important; when the rhetorical Paul tells the rhetorical Timothy to be an example, the Pastor thus portrays Timothy as an example to the pseudepigraphal letter's readers. Timothy's exemplarity has several benefits. By addressing the letter to Timothy, the Pastor can utilize two different figures as examples: Paul as one whose life has been transformed when he became a follower of Jesus, and Timothy as a model for those who continue to progress in faith. The Pastor is also able to establish a pattern of exemplarity from Paul to Timothy to the reader: Jesus transforms Paul, who mentors Timothy. Both the figures of Paul and Timothy and their relationship then serve as models for believers and leaders in the Jesus movement. Furthermore, the Pastor uses the example of Timothy to address certain contemporary issues within the Jesus movement. By portraying Timothy as a young person who is nonetheless exemplary, the Pastor clarifies that while a bishop cannot be a *neophutos* (1 Tim 3:6), this does not preclude young people from serving in positions of leadership in the Jesus movement. Finally, the Pastor may be contesting Timothy's legacy. Whereas in Acts 16:3 Paul has Timothy circumcised, here Paul enjoins Timothy to correct the opponents who allegedly misuse the law.

W. Andrew Smith, Shepherds Theological Seminary
Progress towards the ECM of the Pastoral Epistles

This paper will report on the Museum of the Bible Greek Paul project, currently preparing manuscript transcriptions and collations which will be used for the ECM of the Pastoral Epistles.

Angela Standhartinger, University of Marburg, Germany
Duties of Age: Old Women in the Pastoral Epistles in Context

Besides groups of elders not specified by their gender, only 1 Tim 5:2 and Titus 2:3–5 refer explicitly to elderly women in New Testament letters. This paper places these texts into cultural and social history of elderly women in Greek, Roman, and Jewish antiquity. It will be shown, that old women in antiquity are not only disguised, mocked, or ignored, but also are valued and held in high esteem for their wisdom and the education of the younger generation. They sometimes even take part in the council of elders, a political corpus the Romans called *senatus*, of their city or people. The role of old women in the Pastoral Epistles reflects this reality in manifold ways. The young community leader is reminded of his mother Eunice and grandmother Lois and is asked to talk to old female community members as he would talk to his mother (2 Tim 1:5; 1 Tim 5:1–2.). Besides educating their own children, old women are to instruct young women in household management and point out to them their duties in marriage and childcare. The morality behind this concept is of course on the most conservative side of ancient discourse. Yet, in recent debates on the question whether the Pastoral Epistles want to exclude women from religious roles in general or whether the emphasis on the cardinal virtue *sōphrosyne*, "prudence and modesty," allows women some leading roles in the house and thereby emancipates them in a certain, gender-specific way, this paper argues that both theses are correct but have to be complemented. The designation "old women" contains an intrinsic and thereby explosive tension. The educational task that comes with the highly esteemed wisdom of the old diffuses always beyond families and private houses into the center of communities' leadership. It is, therefore, appropriate to read, with Origen, Titus 2:3 as evidence for an office of female presbyters. One should, however, not restrict this office to priestly services, like presiding at the Eucharist. More likely, female presbyters in antiquity, similar to their male counterparts, fulfilled all duties and tasks that are documented for ancient *gerousiai* and

presbyteria (councils of the Elders/senats of many cities, associations etc.), like political and religious intercessions, representation, and reconciliation, on earth and in heaven. A catalogue of their responsibilities might become visible in the task list of the older widows in 1 Tim 5:3–10.

Adam White, Alphacrucis College
Setting the Boundaries: Reading 1 Timothy and Titus as Community Charters

Those attempting to interpret 1 Timothy and Titus face a myriad of uncertainties. No less amongst these is determining the type of the literature that they are. While they are clearly framed as epistles, they do not resemble anything that is known from the Hellenistic literary theorists. What is generally agreed, however, is that the purpose of the two letters is community formation. That is, 1 Timothy and Titus were written to instruct the recipients on various matters of community structure and organisation. Building on this agreed assumption, it is my contention that the two letters share many of the same characteristics as community charters found in similar, contemporary groups. As autonomous groups, it was the responsibility of professional associations to manage their internal affairs and take responsibility for their members' behaviour. An association would thus have a charter that could be displayed at a meeting place, kept in possession of the officers, or even filed at the office of a local scribe. These charters outlined the various requirements for participation, with particular focus on behaviour at meetings and general conduct of its members in public. We find similar documents amongst the Dead Sea Scrolls, notably, the Community Rule and the Damascus Document. These two texts are primarily concerned with the conduct of group members. The Community Rule, in fact, has been compared directly to the charters of associations; that is, the text is essentially a constitution or charter for the Yahad. It is a similar case with the Damascus Document; however, this text also shares characteristics with 1 Timothy and Titus. Like the two PE, the Damascus Document also contains hortatory material, with the first half functioning as a sermon encouraging faithfulness to God. The second section of the text then forms a set of laws for the community, much like the charter in the Community Rule. While there is clearly a difference between the various type of material we are dealing with (formal charters, sermons, epistles, etc), in all of these examples, we find formal instructions and regulations for various aspects of the community's life. In this paper, 1 Timothy and Titus will be compared side by side with formal charters found in associations as well as in the Essene community, noting the many similarities between them.